



House of Commons  
Scottish Affairs Committee

---

# **Minutes of Proceedings**

---

**Session 2009–10**

## The Scottish Affairs Committee

The Scottish Affairs Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Scotland Office (including (i) relations with the Scottish Parliament and (ii) administration and expenditure of the office of the Advocate General for Scotland but excluding individual cases and advice given within government by the Advocate General).

### Membership during Session 2009–10

Mr Mohammad Sarwar MP, (*Lab, Glasgow Central*) (Chair)  
Mr Alistair Carmichael, (*Lib Dem, Orkney and Shetland*) (added 28.1.08)  
Ms Katy Clark MP, (*Lab, North Ayrshire & Arran*)  
Mr Ian Davidson MP, (*Lab, Glasgow South West*)  
Mr Jim Devine MP, (*Ind, Livingston*)  
Mr Jim McGovern MP, (*Lab, Dundee West*) (discharged 8.11.07, added 4.2.08)  
David Mundell MP, (*Con, Dumfriesshire, Clydesdale and Tweeddale*)  
Lindsay Roy MP, (*Lab, Glenrothes*)  
Mr Charles Walker MP, (*Con, Broxbourne*)  
Mr Ben Wallace MP, (*Con, Lancaster and Wyre*)  
Pete Wishart MP, (*SNP, Perth and North Perthshire*)

### Powers

The committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No. 152. These are available on the Internet via [www.parliament.uk](http://www.parliament.uk).

### Publications

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the Internet at [www.parliament.uk/parliamentary\\_committees/scottish\\_affairs\\_committee.cfm](http://www.parliament.uk/parliamentary_committees/scottish_affairs_committee.cfm).

### Committee staff

The staff of the Committee during Session 2009–10 were Nerys Welfoot (Clerk), Alison Groves (Second Clerk), James Bowman (Committee Assistant), Briony Potts (Committee Assistant), Ameet Chudasama (Committee Assistant), Becky Crew (Committee Assistant), Karen Watling (Committee Assistant) and Karuna Bowry (Committee Support Assistant).

### Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Scottish Affairs Committee, House of Commons, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 6123; the Committee's email address is [scotaffcom@parliament.uk](mailto:scotaffcom@parliament.uk).

# Proceedings of the Committee

---

**Wednesday 25 November 2009**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson

Lindsay Roy

Mr Jim Devine

Pete Wishart

Mr Jim McGovern

## **1. *The Work of the Committee in 2008–09***

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Report (*The Work of the Committee in 2008–09*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*The draft Report was agreed to: the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the First Report of the Committee, HC 71.*

## **2. *Correspondence from the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the written evidence relating to the Scottish Parliament's Economy, Energy and Tourism Committee's Report, *Determining and Delivering on Scotland's energy future*, submitted by the Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. *Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments***

The Committee considered this matter.

## **4. *Banking in Scotland***

The Committee considered this matter.

Mr Colin Borland, Public Affairs Manager, Federation of Small Businesses Scotland, and Mr Norman Banski, Law Society of Scotland; Mr Keith Dryburgh, Social Policy Officer, and Miss Vida Gow, Money Advice Coordinator, Citizens Advice Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 2 December at 2 p.m.]

## Wednesday 2 December 2009

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Alistair Carmichael	Lindsay Roy
Mr Ian Davidson	Mr Charles Walker
Mr Jim Devine	Mr Ben Wallace
David Mundell	Pete Wishart

In the temporary absence of the Chair, Mr Ian Davidson was called to the Chair for part of the meeting.

### **1. Scotland Office Departmental Annual Report 2009**

The Committee considered this matter.

### **2. Banking in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following written evidence relating to Banking in Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

BANK 12A—Supplementary memorandum from the Law Society of Scotland  
BANK 18—Citizens Advice Scotland

Mr Stephen Boyd, Assistant Secretary, Scottish Trades Union Congress, Mr Rob MacGregor, National Officer, Finance and Legal Sector, and Ms Wendy Dunsmore, National Secretary for Lloyds Banking Group, Unite the Union; Mr David Thorburn, Executive Director and Chief Operating Officer, Clydesdale Bank, Mr Stephen Hester, Group Chief Executive, Royal Bank of Scotland, and Mr Adrian Coles, Director General, Building Societies Association, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 9 December at 2 p.m.]

**Wednesday 9 December 2009**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

David Mundell

Mr Ian Davidson

Lindsay Roy

Mr Jim McGovern

Mr Ben Wallace

**1. Scotland Office Departmental Annual Report 2009**

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. Work of the Equality and Human Rights Commission Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Special Report (*Work of the Equality and Human Rights Commission, Scotland: Government Response to the Committee's Third Report of Session 2008–09*), proposed by the Chair, brought up, read the first and second time, and agreed to.

The Government's response, and response of the Chairman of the Equality and Human Rights Commission, to the Third Report from the Committee of Session 2008–09 were appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the First Special Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the report to the House.

**3. Scotland Office White Paper**

The Committee considered this matter.

**4. Banking in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

Mr Archie Kane, Group Executive Director, Insurance, Lloyds Banking Group, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 15 December at 11 a.m.]

**Tuesday 15 December 2009**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson

Pete Wishart

Mr Jim Devine

**1. *Scotland Office Departmental Annual Report 2009***

The Committee considered this matter.

Written evidence relating to the Scotland Office Departmental Annual Report 2009 was reported to the House for printing:

- explanatory memorandum from the Scotland Office on the Winter Supplementary Estimate 2008;
- explanatory memorandum from the Scotland Office on the Spring supplementary Estimate 2009;
- explanatory memoranda from the Scotland Office on the Winter Supplementary Estimate 2009;
- supplementary memoranda on the Departmental Annual Report (DAR 01 and 02)
- note from the Scrutiny Unit dated 8 December.

**2. *Scotland Office White Paper***

The Committee considered this matter.

**3. *Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments***

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 January 2012 at 10 a.m.]

**Tuesday 12 January 2010**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Alistair Carmichael	David Mundell
Ms Katy Clark	Lindsay Roy
Mr Ian Davidson	Mr Ben Wallace
Mr Jim McGovern	Pete Wishart

**1. *Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following written evidence relating to Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

COMM1—Tam Dalyell  
COMM2—Scotland Office  
COMM3—Scottish Executive  
COMM4—Royal Society of Edinburgh

*Ordered*, That the Royal Society of Edinburgh be authorised to publish their written evidence on Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments, in accordance with the provisions of Standing Order No.135.

Rt Hon Alex Salmond MSP MP, First Minister of Scotland, and Sir John Elvidge KCB, Permanent Secretary, Scottish Executive; and Mr Kenny MacAskill MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Justice, and Mr Robert Gordon CB, Director-General, Justice and Communities, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 January at 2 p.m.]

### Wednesday 13 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson  
David Mundell

Lindsay Roy  
Pete Wishart

#### **1. Banking in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

Lord Myners, Financial Services Secretary, HM Treasury, and Mr Robin Haynes, Head of Financial Services, Scotland Office, gave oral evidence.

#### **2. Scotland Office White Paper and the recommendations of the Commission on Scottish Devolution**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee hold a seminar on the recommendations of the Commission on Scottish Devolution relating to the House of Commons.

The Committee further considered this matter.

Rt Hon Jim Murphy MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, and Mr Robin Haynes, Head of Financial Services, Scotland Office, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 27 January at 2 p.m.]

### Wednesday 27 January 2010

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson  
Lindsay Roy  
Mr Ben Wallace

Mr Charles Walker  
Pete Wishart

#### **1. Banking in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee cancel the visit to Iceland in connection with its inquiry into Banking in Scotland.



## **2. Enforcement of the National Minimum Wage in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Special Report (*Enforcement of the National Minimum Wage in Scotland: Government Response to the Committee's Sixth Report of Session 2008–09*), proposed by the Chair, brought up, read the first and second time, and agreed to.

The Government's response to the Sixth Report from the Committee of Session 2008–09 was appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Second Special Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the report to the House.

## **3. Commission on Scottish Devolution**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **4. Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee cancel the visit to Brussels in connection with its inquiry into Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments.

Rt Hon Jack Straw MP, Secretary of State for Justice, Rt Hon Jim Murphy MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, and, Professor Jim Gallagher, Director General, Devolution, Ministry of Justice, gave oral evidence

[Adjourned till Wednesday 10 February at 2 p.m.]

## **Wednesday 10 February 2010**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson  
David Mundell  
Lindsay Roy

Mr Charles Walker  
Pete Wishart

## **1. Commission on Scottish Devolution**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Banking in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following written evidence relating to Banking in Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

- BANK 11a—Supplementary evidence from Unite the Union
- BANK 12b—Supplementary evidence from the Law Society of Scotland
- BANK 13a— Supplementary evidence from Lloyds Banking Group
- BANK 17a— Supplementary evidence from Royal Bank of Scotland Group
- BANK 18a— Supplementary evidence from Citizens Advice Scotland
- BANK 19— Supplementary evidence from HM Treasury

## **3. Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following written evidence relating to Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments be reported to the House for publishing on the internet:

- COMM3a—Supplementary evidence from the Scottish Executive
- COMM3b— Supplementary evidence from the Scottish Executive

Chris Bryant MP, Minister for Europe, and Mr David Slater, Deputy Head of Communications, Institutions, Treaty and Iberia Group, Foreign and Commonwealth Office, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 24 February at 2 p.m.]

### **Wednesday 24 February 2010**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Lindsay Roy

Mr Charles Walker

## ***Banking in Scotland***

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Report (*Banking in Scotland*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*The draft Report was agreed to: the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Second Report of the Committee, HC 70.*

*Resolved, That the Committee visit Glasgow, in connection with the inquiry into Banking in Scotland for the purposes of launching the Committee's Report.*

[Adjourned till Wednesday 3 March at 2 p.m.]

### **Wednesday 3 March 2010**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Lindsay Roy

Mr Ian Davidson

Pete Wishart

#### **1. *Spring Supplementary Estimate 2010***

The Committee considered this matter.

#### **2. *Commission on Scottish Devolution***

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Report (*Commission on Scottish Devolution*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*The draft Report was agreed to: the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Third Report of the Committee, HC 255.*

#### **3. *Student Loans Company***

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 10 March at 2 p.m.]

### **Monday 8 March 2010**

*The Chair, Mr Jim McGovern and Lindsay Roy visited Glasgow in connection with the Committee's inquiry into Banking in Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 24 February.*

### Wednesday 10 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson  
David Mundell

Lindsay Roy

#### **1. *Spring Supplementary Estimate 2010***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the Explanatory Memorandum from the Scotland Office on the Spring Supplementary Estimate 2010 be reported to the House for publication.

#### **2. *Student Loans Company***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Chair, Mr Ian Davidson and the Clerk have leave to visit the Student Loans Company in Glasgow.

#### **3. *Commission on Scottish Devolution***

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 17 March at 2 p.m.]

### Wednesday 17 March 2010

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark  
Mr Ian Davidson  
David Mundell

Lindsay Roy  
Pete Wishart

#### **1. *Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments***

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Student Loans Company**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the written evidence relating to proposed job losses at the Student Loans Company, submitted by the Public Commercial Services Union be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 23 March at 3 p.m.]

### **Friday 19 March 2010**

*The Chair, Mr Ian Davidson and the Clerk visited Glasgow in accordance with the Committee's decision of 10 March.*

### **Tuesday 23 March 2010**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Mr Ian Davidson

David Mundell

Lindsay Roy

Mr Ben Wallace

Pete Wishart

## **1. Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments**

The Committee considered this matter.

Draft Report (*Scotland and the UK: cooperation and communication between governments*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*The draft Report was agreed to: the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Fourth Report of the Committee, HC 256.*

## **2. Student Loans Company**

The Committee considered this matter.

[The Committee adjourned.]