



House of Commons  
Scottish Affairs Committee

---

# Minutes of Proceedings

---

Session 2012–13

## The Scottish Affairs Committee

The Scottish Affairs Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Scotland Office (including (i) relations with the Scottish Parliament and (ii) administration and expenditure of the offices of the Advocate General for Scotland (but excluding individual cases and advice given within government by the Advocate General)).

### Current membership

Mr Ian Davidson MP (*Labour/Co-op, Glasgow South West*) (Chair)  
Mike Crockart MP (*Liberal Democrat, Edinburgh West*)  
Mrs Eleanor Laing MP (*Conservative, Epping Forest*)  
Jim McGovern MP (*Labour, Dundee West*)  
Graeme Morrice MP (*Labour, Livingston*)  
Pamela Nash MP (*Labour, Airdrie and Shotts*)  
Sir Jim Paice MP (*Conservative, South East Cambridgeshire*)  
Simon Reeve MP (*Conservative, Dewsbury*)  
Mr Alan Reid MP (*Liberal Democrat, Argyll and Bute*)  
Lindsay Roy MP (*Labour, Glenrothes*)  
Dr Eilidh Whiteford MP (*Scottish National Party, Banff and Buchan*)

The following members were also members of the committee during the Parliament:

Fiona Bruce MP (*Conservative, Congleton*)  
Mike Freer MP (*Conservative, Finchley and Golders Green*)  
Cathy Jamieson MP (*Labour/Co-op, Kilmarnock and Loudoun*)  
Mark Menzies MP (*Conservative, Fylde*)  
Iain McKenzie MP (*Labour, Inverclyde*)  
David Mowat MP (*Conservative, Warrington South*)  
Fiona O'Donnell MP (*Labour, East Lothian*)  
Julian Smith MP (*Conservative, Skipton and Ripon*)

### Powers

The committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No 152. These are available on the internet via [www.parliament.uk](http://www.parliament.uk).

### Publication

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the internet at [www.parliament.uk/scotaffcom](http://www.parliament.uk/scotaffcom). A list of Reports of the Committee in the present parliament is at the back of this volume.

The Reports of the Committee, the formal minutes relating to that report, oral evidence taken and some or all written evidence are available in a printed volume. Additional written evidence may be published on the internet only.

### Committee staff

The current staff of the Committee are Eliot Wilson (Clerk), Duma Langton (Inquiry Manager), Gabrielle Hill (Senior Committee Assistant) and Ravi Abhayaratne (Committee Support Assistant).

### Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Scottish Affairs Committee, House of Commons, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 6123; the Committee's email address is [scotaffcom@parliament.uk](mailto:scotaffcom@parliament.uk)

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 16 May 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Mike Freer  
Iain McKenzie

Simon Reeve  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that the following written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

Daniel Kenealy; The Church of Scotland; Patrick Layden; No Campaign Limited.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Patrick Layden TD QC, Scottish Law Commissioner, and Professor Andrew Scott, Professor of European Studies, School of Law, University of Edinburgh; Kenny Jordan, Regional Secretary, Confederation of Shipbuilding and Engineering Unions, Duncan McPhee, Unite Senior Shop Steward, BAE Systems, Scotstoun, Raymond Duguid, Unite Senior Shop Steward, Babcock Marine, Rosyth, and Eric McLeod, GMB Senior Shop Steward, Babcock Marine, Rosyth (at 4.30 p.m.), gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 22 May 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 22 May 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Pamela Nash

Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, That Mr Alan Ritchie be appointed a Specialist Adviser to assist the Committee in its inquiry into Blacklisting in Employment.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

Mrs Maria Fyfe, anti-blacklisting campaigner, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 23 May 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 23 May 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
David Mowat

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Professor Hew Strachan, Chichele Professor of the History of War, University of Oxford, Professor Malcolm Chalmers, Research Director, UK Defence Policy, Royal United Services Institute, and Francis Tusa, Editor, Defence Analysis, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 June 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 12 June 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid

## **1. Blacklisting in Employment**

Dave Smith, Blacklist Support Group, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 June 2012 at 4.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 13 June 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

David Mowat  
Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Attendance statistics**

*Ordered*, that statistics on Members' attendance at formal meetings of the Committee in Session 2010–12 be uploaded to the Committee's website.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Resolved*, That The Chair and Mr Alan Reid have leave to visit Bute, for the purposes of the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in a representative capacity.

*Resolved*, That Committee visit Faslane, in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

## **4. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Resolved*, That Committee visit Edinburgh, in connection with its inquiry into Blacklisting in Employment.

## **5. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that the written evidence relating to the Referendum on Separation for Scotland submitted by CBI Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **6. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Nick Harvey MP, Minister of State for the Armed Forces, and Peter Luff MP, Minister for Defence Equipment, Support and Technology, Ministry of Defence, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 19 June 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 19 June 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

Francis Graham and Steuart Merchant gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 20 June 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]



# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 20 June 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

David Mowatt  
Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Lt Col (Retd) Stuart Crawford and Richard Marsh, economist, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 27 June 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 27 June 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
David Mowatt

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

Resolved, That the Committee inquire into blacklisting in employment.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Kenny Newton and the Joseph Rowntree Foundation be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Jeremy Purvis, Reform Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 3 July 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 3 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid

## **1. A Robust Grid for 21<sup>st</sup> Century Scotland**

Draft Report (*A Robust Grid for 21st Century Scotland*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating the consideration of the Report are published with the First Report of the Committee, HC 499.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 4 July 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 4 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
David Mowatt

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

John McCormick, Electoral Commissioner with responsibility for Scotland, Lisa Klein, Director of Party and Election Finance, and Andy O'Neill, Head of Office Scotland, The Electoral Commission, gave oral evidence.

Professor Sarah Birch, Department of Government, University of Essex, and Professor Justin Fisher, Professor of Political Science, Brunel University, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 10 July 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 10 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

Nancy Kelly, Joseph Rowntree Foundation, Dr Alistair Geddes, University of Dundee, and Professor Gary Craig, Durham University, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 11 July 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 11 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
David Mowatt

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 16 July 2012 at 4.15 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Monday 16 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

John Ainslie, Scottish CND, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 17 July 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 17 July 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Making the process legal**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Making the process legal*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*Ordered*, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating the consideration of the Report are published with the Second Report of the Committee, HC 542.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland : A multi-question referendum?**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: A multi-question referendum?*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

*Ordered*, That the draft Report be read a second time, paragraph by paragraph.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating the consideration of the Report are published with the Third Report of the Committee, HC 543.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 4 September 2012 at 1.00 p.m.]

*Monday 27 August*

*The Chair and Mr Alan Reid visited Bute, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in a representative capacity, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 13 June.*

*Tuesday 28 August – Wednesday 29 August*

*The Chair, Pamela Nash, Mr Alan Reid and Lindsay Roy visited Faslane, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 13 June.*

*Monday 3 September*

*The Chair, Iain McKenzie and Lindsay Roy visited Edinburgh, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into Blacklisting in Employment, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 13 June.*



# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 4 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

*Ordered*, that the following written evidence relating to the future of HM Coastguard in Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

Inverclyde Council; South Ayrshire Council.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Unite be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **4. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

Stuart Atkinson, Assistant District Officer, MRCC Clyde, Dave Macbeth, Assistant Secretary, MCA Section, PCS, and Clive Welch, retired coastguard, gave oral evidence.

## **5. Blacklisting in Employment**

Gail Cartmail, Assistant General Secretary, Unite, Justin Bowden, National Officer, and Harry Donaldson, Scottish Regional Secretary, GMB, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 5 September at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 5 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
David Mowat

Pamela Nash  
Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland submitted by Professor Bernard Ryan be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **2. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Professor Bernard Ryan, University of Kent Law School, and Professor Jo Shaw, University of Edinburgh Law School, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 11 September at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 11 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Crown Estate in Scotland**

*Resolved*, That Committee visit Inverness, in connection with its inquiry into The Crown Estate in Scotland.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Resolved*, That Committee visit Fife, in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

## **4. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that the following written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

Francis Tusa; Professor Jo Shaw; Dr Phillips O'Brien.

## **5. The Future of HM Coastguard**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland submitted by East Dunbartonshire Council be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 12 September 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 12 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Fiona Bruce  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Professor William Walker, School of International Relations, University of St Andrews, and Dr Phillips O'Brien, Scottish Centre for War Studies, University of Glasgow, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Monday 17 September 2012 at 4.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Monday 17 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by the Electoral Commission be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Rt Hon Michael Moore MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, Rt Hon David Mundell MP, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Scotland and Alun Evans, Director, Scotland Office, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 18 September 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 18 September 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

The Committee agreed to travel to Edinburgh in conjunction with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

## **3. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland, submitted by the Public and Commercial Services Union be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **4. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

Stephen Hammond MP, Under-Secretary of State for Transport, and Sir Alan Massey KCB CBE, Chief Executive, Maritime and Coastguard Agency, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 16 October 2012 at 11.00 a.m.]

*Monday 24 September*

*The Chair, Jim McGovern, Iain McKenzie, Mr Alan Reid and Lindsay Roy visited Inverness, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Crown Estate in Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 11 September.*

*Wednesday 26 - Thursday 27 September*

*The Chair, Jim McGovern, Iain McKenzie and Lindsay Roy visited Fife, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 11 September.*

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 16 October 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that the following written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland be reported to the House for publication on the internet:

The Secretary of State for Scotland; The Ministry of Defence.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Carillion be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

David Smith, Deputy Information Commissioner and David Clancy, Investigations Manager, Information Commissioner's Office, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 17 October 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 17 October 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 23 October 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]



# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 23 October 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid

Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to the Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland, submitted by the Department for Transport be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by Babcock be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Resolved*, that the Committee visit Glencorse Barracks and SELEX in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

*Resolved*, that the Committee visit Govan in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

## **4. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating the consideration of the Report are published with the Fourth Report of the Committee, HC 676.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 30 October 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 30 October 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The McKay Commission on the consequences of devolution**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Cross-border Rail Franchises**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

Steve Murphy, General Secretary, and Jim Kennedy, National Political Officer, UCATT gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 31 October 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 31 October 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## 1. Future programme

The Committee considered this matter

## 2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland

Rt Hon Michael Moore MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, Rt Hon David Mundell MP, Parliamentary Under-Secretary of State for Scotland, Alun Evans, Director and Chris Flatt, Deputy Director, Scotland Office, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 6 November 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

*Thursday 1 November*

*The Chair, Pamela Nash, Mr Alan Reid and Lindsay Roy visited Edinburgh (Glencorse Barracks and SELEX Galileo), in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 23 October.*

*Monday 5 November*

*The Chair, Pamela Nash, Mr Alan Reid and Lindsay Roy visited Govan, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 23 October.*

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 6 November 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## 1. Declaration of Members' interests

Mike Crockart declared his interests, in accordance with the Resolution of the House of 13 July 1992 as follows:

Gifts, benefits and hospitality (UK)

Name of donor: Royal Bank of Scotland plc  
Address of donor: 36 St Andrew Square, Edinburgh EH2 2YB

Amount of donation or nature and value if donation in kind:

- (1) Hospitality for women in business round table event which I hosted in Edinburgh on 11 January 2013, value approx £320;
- (2) Hospitality in the RBS suite at Murrayfield for the Scotland v Ireland match, value approx £350;

Date of receipt of donation:

- (1) 11 January 2013;
- (2) 24 February 2013

Date of acceptance of donation:

- (1) 11 January 2013;
- (2) 24 February 2013

Donor status: company, registration no SC90312

## 2. Future programme

The Committee considered this matter.

## 3. Blacklisting in Employment

Alan Wainwright, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Monday 12 November 2012 at 5.30 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Monday 12 November 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Alan Wainwright be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **2. Crown Estate**

*Ordered*, That Mr Robin Callander be appointed a Specialist Adviser to assist the Committee in matters relating to the Crown Estate inquiry.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?**

*Resolved*, That the Chair write to the Scottish Government.

## **4. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

Draft Report (*The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland*) proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating the consideration of the Report are published with the Fourth Report of the Committee, HC 583.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 20 November 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 20 November 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by UCATT and the Office of the Information Commissioner be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Blair Jenkins, Chief Executive, Yes Scotland and Blair McDougall, Campaign Director, Better Together, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 21 November 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 21 November 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Ian Godden, Farnborough Airshow, and Professor Trevor Taylor and Dr John Louth, RUSI, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 27 November 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 27 November 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Blacklisting in Employment**

Ian Kerr gave oral evidence on oath.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: evidence**

*Resolved*, that the Committee visit Chemring (Ardeer) and Thales (Govan) in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

*Resolved*, that the Chair and Lindsay Roy have leave to visit DM Beith in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland in a representative capacity.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: evidence**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by Scottish Engineering be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 5 December 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

*Monday 3 December*

*The Chair, Jim McGovern, Pamela Nash and Lindsay Roy visited Chemring (Ardeer) and Thales (Govan), in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 27 November.*



# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 5 December 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 11 December 2012 at 2.00 p.m.]

*Thursday 6 December*

*The Chair and Lindsay Roy visited DM Beith, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in a representational capacity in accordance with the Committee's decision of 27 November.*

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 11 December 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 12 December 2012 at 3.30 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 12 December 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockett  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 19 December 2012 at 10.30 a.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 19 December 2012**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Iain Mckenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Philip Dunne MP, Minister for Defence Equipment, Support and Technology, Vice-Admiral Andrew Mathews CB FREng, Chief of Materiel (Fleet), and Les Mosco BSc FCIPS, Commercial Director, Defence Equipment and Support, Ministry of Defence, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 8 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 8 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?**

Draft Special Report, (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?: Government Response to the Committee’s Fourth Report of Session 2012–13*), proposed by the Chair, brought up, read the first and second time and agreed to.

The Government’s response to the Fourth Report of Session 2012–13 from the Committee was appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the First Special Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: The proposed section 30 Order—Can a player also be the referee?**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 9 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 9 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: The proposed section 30 Order—Can a player also be the referee?**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: The proposed section 30 Order—Can a player also be the referee?*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Sixth Report of the Committee, HC 863.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Borders, citizenship and nationality**

Professor Colin Harvey, School of Law, Queen's University, Belfast, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 15 January 2013 at 9.30 a.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 15 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Separation and Shipyards**

The Committee considered this matter

[Adjourned till Wednesday 16 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 16 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Separation and Shipyards**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Separation shuts shipyards*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Seventh Report of the Committee, HC 892.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to the Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by BAE Systems and Royal United Services Institute, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 22 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]



# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 22 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie  
Pamela Nash

Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Blacklisting in Employment**

Cullum McAlpine, Director, Sir Robert McAlpine Ltd, gave oral evidence on oath.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that supplementary written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment, submitted by Carillion and Ian Kerr, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 23 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 23 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Professor Malcolm Chalmers, Research Director, RUSI, and Professor Ron Smith, Department of Economics, Birkbeck, University of London, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 30 January 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 30 January 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Freer  
Jim McGovern  
Iain McKenzie

Pamela Nash  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Declaration of Members' Interests**

Graeme Morrice declared his interests, in accordance with the resolution of the House of 13 July 1992, as follows:

Remunerated employment, office, profession etc

Payments from Ipsos MORI, 79-81 Borough Road London SE1 1FY, for participating in parliamentary surveys.

Payment of £150. Hours: 1 hr. (Registered 28 January 2012)

Miscellaneous

Member of West Lothian Council until 4 May 2012. No salary taken since the general election.

Eleanor Laing declared her interests, in accordance with the resolution of the House of 13 July 1992, as follows:

Nil.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that supplementary written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by The Secretary of State for Scotland and Department for Transport, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment, submitted by John Swinney MSP, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **4. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Lt Col (Retd) Stuart Crawford and Richard Marsh, Economist, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 5 February 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 5 February 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash

Sir Jim Paice  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## 1. Declaration of Members' Interests

Sir Jim Paice declared his interests, in accordance with the resolution of the House of 13 July 1992, as follows:

Remunerated employment, office, profession etc

Partner in smallholding in Cambridgeshire, on which I make no drawings.

Gifts, benefits and hospitality (UK)

Name of donor: Heineken UK Limited

Address of donor : 2-4 Broadway Park, South Gyle Broadway, Edinburgh EH12 9JZ

Amount of donation or nature and value if donation in kind: my wife and I were guests at the

Grand National race meeting including overnight accommodation; value £1,010

Date of receipt of donation: 14 April 2012

Date of acceptance of donation: 14 April 2012

Donor status: company, registration number SC065527

(Registered 23 April 2012)

Land and Property

Smallholding in Cambridgeshire, which is my main home.

Flat in London from which I derive rental income.(Registered 3 December 2012)

## 2. Blacklisting in Employment

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment, submitted by George Fuller, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## 3. Blacklisting in Employment

Jack Winder, former Director, Caprim Ltd., gave oral evidence on oath.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 6 February 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 6 February 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Eleanor Laing  
Jim McGovern  
Graeme Morrice

Pamela Nash  
Sir Jim Paice  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland**

Draft Special Report, (*The Future of HM Coastguard in Scotland: Government Response to the Committee's Fifth Report of Session 2012–13*), proposed by the Chair, brought up, read the first and second time and agreed to.

The Government's response to the Fifth Report of Session 2012–13 from the Committee was appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Second Special Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, submitted by Scottish Public Pensions Agency, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 February 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 12 February 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash

Sir James Paice  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

Stanley Hardy TD, former Director, Caprim Ltd, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 February 2013 at 1.30 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 13 February 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Mrs Eleanor Laing  
Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash

Sir James Paice  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## 1. Future Programme

The Committee considered this matter.

## 2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland

*Resolved*, that the Committee visit Army HQ Scotland in connection with its inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland.

## 2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland

Rt Hon Michael Moore MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, and Rt Hon David Mundell MP, Parliamentary-Under Secretary of State, Scotland Office, and Rt Hon Lord Wallace of Tankerness QC, Advocate General for Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 27 February 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

*Thursday 21 February*

*The Chair, Mike Crockart and Pamela Nash visited Army HQ Scotland, in connection with the Committee's inquiry into The Referendum on Separation for Scotland, in accordance with the Committee's decision of 13 February.*

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 27 February 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mrs Eleanor Laing  
Jim McGovern

Graeme Morrice  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Ministerial Correspondence**

*Ordered*, that the letter, submitted by the Scottish Government, relating to the Committee's Fourth Report of session 2012–13, *The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Terminating Trident—Days or Decades?*, be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

The Committee considered this matter

## **4. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter

[Adjourned till Tuesday 5 March 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]



# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 5 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash  
Sir Jim Paice

Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Remploy Marine Textiles Fife**

*Resolved*, That the Committee inquire into Remploy Marine Textiles, Fife.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Harvey Francis be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **4. Blacklisting in Employment**

Harvey Francis, Executive Vice President, Human Resources, Communication and IT, Skanska UK, gave oral evidence on oath.

[Adjourned till Thursday 7 March 2013 at 11.15 a.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Thursday 7 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Eleanor Laing  
Graeme Morrice

Mr Alan Ried  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **4. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

Martin McCurley, Trade Union Convenor, Unite, RNAD Cowlport, Jim Conroy, Chair, Shop Stewards' Committee, Unite, Faslane, and Richie Calder, Shop Steward, Unite, Faslane gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 March 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 12 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash

Simon Reeve  
Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment, submitted by Balfour Beatty be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment**

Mike Peasland, CEO, Construction Services UK, Balfour Beatty, gave oral evidence on oath.

[Adjourned till Wednesday 13 March 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Wednesday 13 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Jim McGovern  
Graeme Morrice

Pamela Nash  
Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

In the temporary absence of the Chairman, Mr Alan Reid was called to the Chair for the remainder of the meeting.

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Remploy Marine Textiles Fife**

*Ordered*, that written evidence relating to Remploy Marine Textiles Fife submitted by Cllr David Ross be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. Remploy Marine Textiles Fife**

Cllr David Ross, Depute Leader, Fife Council, John Moist, Friends of Remploy and Lyn Turner, Regional Secretary of Unite, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 19 March 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 19 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Mrs Eleanor Laing  
Graeme Morrice

Pamela Nash  
Simon Reeve  
Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

In the temporary absence of the Chairman, Mr Alan Reid was called to the Chair for part of the meeting.

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Blacklisting in Employment**

*Ordered*, that the written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment, submitted by Chidi Obihara and Carillion plc be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

## **3. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland**

John McCormick, Electoral Commissioner for Scotland, Andrew Scallan, Director of Electoral Administration, Andy O'Neill, Head of Office Scotland;

Tony Stafford, Head of Policy, The Electoral Commission;

Simon Lowe, Head of the Defence Personnel Secretariat, Ministry of Defence, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Thursday 21 March 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Thursday 21 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Alan Reid, in the Chair

Jim McGovern  
Pamela Nash

Lindsay Roy

In the temporary absence of the Chairman, Mr Alan Reid was called to the Chair for the meeting.

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. Remploy Marine Textiles Fife**

Esther McVey MP, Minister for Disabled People and Jeremy Moore, Director for Disability and Work Opportunities, Department of Work and Pensions, and Ian Russell CBE, Chairman of the Board, Remploy, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Monday 25 March 2013 at 7.00 p.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Monday 25 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Eleanor laing  
Graeme Morrice

Sir Jim Paice  
Lindsay Roy

## 1. Future Programme

The Committee considered this matter.

## 2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Separation shuts shipyards

Draft Special Report, (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: Separation shuts shipyards: Government Response to the Committee's Seventh Report of Session 2012–13*), proposed by the Chair, brought up, read the first and second time and agreed to.

The Government's response to the Seventhth Report of Session 2012–13 from the Committee was appended to the Report.

*Resolved*, That the Report be the Third Special Report of the Committee to the House.

*Ordered*, That the Chair make the Report to the House.

## 3. Blacklisting in Employment

*Ordered*, that the supplementary written evidence relating to Blacklisting in Employment submitted by Balfour Beatty be reported to the House for publication on the internet.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 26 March 2013 at 10.00 a.m.]

# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 26 March 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Eleanor Laing  
Jim McGovern  
Graeme Morrice

Pamela Nash  
Sir Jim Paice  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: How would separation affect jobs in the Scottish defence industry?**

Draft Report (*The Referendum on Separation for Scotland: How would separation affect jobs in the Scottish defence industry?*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Eighth Report of the Committee, HC 957.

## **3. Blacklisting in Employment: Interim Report**

Draft Report (*Blacklisting in Employment: Interim Report*), proposed by the Chair, brought up and read.

The draft Report was agreed to; the Formal Minutes relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the Ninth Report of the Committee, HC 1071.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 16 April 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]



# Formal Minutes

---

**Tuesday 16 April 2013**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mike Crockart  
Graeme Morrice  
Pamela Nash  
Sir Jim Paice

Simon Reeve  
Mr Alan Reid  
Lindsay Roy

## **1. Future Programme**

The Committee considered this matter.

## **2. The State of the Scottish Economy**

Iain McMillan CBE, Director, and Laura McMahon, Policy Executive, CBI Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 14 May 2013 at 2.00 p.m.]