Northern Ireland Affairs Committee
Committee Office House of Commons London SW1A 0AA
Tel: 020 7219 2173 Email:northircom@parliament.uk

Robin McCormick
General Manager, SONI
Castleragh House
12 Manse Road
Belfast
BT6 9RT

16 May 2018

Dear Mr. McCormick,

Electricity in Northern Ireland: Follow-Up

On 26 April 2017 our predecessor Committee published a report on Northern Ireland's electricity sector.\(^1\) This report sought to identify challenges and key issues for the sector, and recommend policy changes to the UK Government and Northern Ireland Executive. The Committee focused on the lack of a long-term electricity policy for Northern Ireland, potential threats to security of supply, issues arising from Brexit, and changes which could result from the initiation of the Integrated Single Electricity Market (I-SEM)—which is intended to build on the work of the SEM and deliver increased levels of competition. The Committee's recommendations aimed at achieving a more secure, affordable, and sustainable energy sector for Northern Ireland.

Since the previous Committee's report, the Northern Ireland Executive has remained collapsed, meaning the continued absence of an energy policymaking body for Northern Ireland, and there have been a number of developments in Northern Ireland's electricity sector.

In December 2017 the provisional results for the first round of the new I-SEM Capacity Remuneration Mechanism (CRM) Auction were announced.\(^2\) These were confirmed in January 2018, and several generating units at AES UK & Ireland power stations at Kilroot and Ballylumford were unsuccessful in securing new contracts. As a result, AES UK & Ireland announced that it expected two generating units at Kilroot to close on 23 May 2018, and one generating unit at Ballylumford power station to close by the end of 2018.\(^3\)

\(^2\) EirGrid and Soni, *Capacity Market – Provisional Capacity Auction Results*, December 2017
\(^3\) AES UK & Ireland, *Kilroot Power Station Faces Closure Following All-Island Auction Results*, 25 January 2018
Negotiations between the UK and the EU regarding the UK’s withdrawal from and future relationship with the EU continue, and it remains to be seen what, if any, consequences Brexit will have for the all-island electricity market.

In light of the above developments, and the ongoing absence of a Northern Ireland Executive, we decided to follow-up on our predecessor Committee’s inquiry. We have collected written and oral evidence on a number of electricity issues, including security of supply, the I-SEM, the proposed closures of generating units at Kilroot and Ballylumford power stations, and the challenges created by the ongoing absence of the Northern Ireland Executive. We thank you for your contribution to this evidence gathering.

Since we took evidence on this subject, it has been announced that the go-live date for the I-SEM has been delayed from 23 May to 1 October 2018, due to “IT defects” which need to be resolved. Concerns have also been raised that reduced generating capacity of Hunterston B nuclear power station in Ayrshire will limit the electricity which is available to Northern Ireland from the Moyle interconnector.

This letter reflects evidence submitted on these topics and asks for additional information on a number of areas where SONI has responsibilities.

Transition to the I-SEM and proposed station closures

We have heard concerns about the implications the transition to the I-SEM, and the new Capacity Remuneration Mechanism, could have for generating capacity and security of supply, and the cost of electricity in Northern Ireland.

Our predecessor Committee found that the Single Electricity Market, established in 2007 between Northern Ireland and the Republic, has brought considerable benefits to Northern Ireland. The SEM has allowed for Ireland and Northern Ireland to benefit from greater economies of scale, cheaper electricity prices, and improved security of supply. These benefits are expected to continue with the initiation of the I-SEM, which we have been told will further increase competition, drive down costs to consumers, spur industry innovation, and make the electricity sector more flexible. While the Committee supports the all-island electricity market, we are concerned that, if not handled properly, the transition to the I-SEM may negatively impact Northern Ireland’s businesses, security of supply, and electricity prices.

In January 2018, the results for the first I-SEM Capacity Remuneration Mechanism (CRM) Auctions were confirmed. These auctions saw AES UK & Ireland, Northern Ireland’s largest electricity generator, lose key electricity contracts for its Kilroot and

---

4 SONI (System Operator for Northern Ireland) Statement on Postponement of Isem Go-Live, 17 April 2018
5 News Letter, Power supply fears prompt call to keep Kilroot open, 7 May 2018
Ballylumford power stations. These losses prompted AES to propose the early closure of generating units at these power stations. AES explained that:

Without new contracts, these ... units cannot cover their fixed costs and the two generation units at Kilroot are expected to close when the ISEM market commences on 23 May 2018, with the Ballylumford generation unit expected to close on 31 December 2018.

We have heard concerns that the early closures of generating units at Kilroot and Ballylumford power stations could—in the absence of the new interconnector between Ireland and Northern Ireland, which is not expected to be operational before 2020—jeopardise Northern Ireland’s security of supply, and increase the cost of electricity for consumers in Northern Ireland.

Under normal procedures, we understand that closures of power stations and other key energy infrastructure components must be preceded by a three-year notice. This period serves to give adequate time to the Executive, the Utility Regulator, and SONI to prepare for changes to the grid. Robin McCormick explained, however, that AES "requested a derogation from that three-year period to close its plant on 23 May [2018]."

To process the derogation request, the Utility Regulator has asked SONI to complete an assessment on the impact of the proposed closures. SONI’s assessment will inform the decision-making processes of the Utility Regulator in handling AES’s derogation request.

We understand that SONI has provided an assessment to the Utility Regulator, but has been asked to conduct a further assessment before a decision on the derogation is reached.

Given the above, we would welcome your response to the following questions.

1. What were the conclusions of the assessment that you conducted for the Utility Regulator, to inform its decision on the request for derogation made by AES regarding the early closure of generating units at Kilroot and Ballylumford?

   a. For what reasons have you been asked to conduct a further assessment to inform the Utility Regulator’s decision, and how will this differ from your initial assessment?

   b. What engagement have you had with AES to inform these assessments?

---

6 AES UK & Ireland, Kilroot Power Station Faces Closure Following All-Island Auction Results, 25 January 2018
7 AES UK & Ireland, Kilroot Power Station Faces Closure Following All-Island Auction Results, 25 January 2018
8 Q7
2. If generating units at Kilroot and Ballylumford are closed this year, what is SONI’s view of Northern Ireland’s security of supply, particularly given these closures would precede the new North/South Interconnector becoming operational, and that electricity from wind generators and the Moyle interconnector is not guaranteed?

3. What assessment have you made of the delay to the go-live date for the I-SEM have on the all-island electricity market and security of supply for Northern Ireland?

We recognize SONI’s important role in ensuring stability and security in Northern Ireland’s electricity grid, and urge SONI to be diligent in making its assessment. As we have heard, SONI remains the principal source of expertise and assurance regarding security of supply and the at-large power grid. As such, there is a need for the System Operator to be certain, and provide transparent data justifying said certainty, that Northern Ireland has sufficient energy supply to meet peak demand.

We thank you for your consideration of our questions, and we look forward to hearing your response. Given the time-sensitive nature of these issues, we would appreciate an early response to the questions regarding the proposed closures at Kilroot and Ballylumford by 31 May 2018.

Pursuantly,

Dr Andrew Murrison MP
Chair, Northern Ireland Affairs Committee