## EXHIBIT LIST

Reference No: HOC/00090  
Petitioner: Whitmore Parish Council  
Published to Collaboration Area: Thursday 19-Apr-2018

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Exhibit Name</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>A28 Whitmore PC Presentation.pdf (A28)</td>
<td>2 - 27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Page 1 of 27
WHITMORE PARISH COUNCIL

PRESENTATION TO THE HS2 PHASE 2A SELECT COMMITTEE

24th April 2018

Ian Webb
Chair WPC
BACKGROUND

Whitmore is an area of about 20 sq. miles, within the Borough of Newcastle Under Lyme in the County of Staffordshire.

There are around 700 dwellings. The population in 2011 was 1,554. Its largest settlements are the village of Baldwins Gate, Madeley Park Wood and Whitmore Heath. Smaller villages are Acton, Butterton and Whitmore village.

The parish is dominated by green belt, which stretches from the M6 motorway to the West Coast Mainline. On the other side of the railway line the undeveloped land beyond the village envelope of Baldwins Gate is classed as ‘open countryside’.

Whitmore parish has two conservation areas, in Whitmore village and Butterton, and three areas of biodiversity that are designated as ‘Natural Areas’. Wilkins Pleck garden and Cudmore Fisheries are located on Three Mile Lane.

The Parish is bisected by the A53 which runs through the main village of Baldwins Gate, East - West. This is a busy thoroughfare linking the Pottery towns with South Wales and The West.
Whitmore - Historical and Beautiful

[Images of Whitmore: a church, a large house, and a pub.]
What we are petitioning for

Whitmore Parish Council and Madeley Parish Council jointly wish to apply for “An Additional Provision” to the HS2 Hybrid Bill. We will present separately (Whitmore followed directly by Madeley) BUT in common accord, both urging the Government to modify the current project design by introducing a tunnel running from South of the A53 in Whitmore Parish to North of Bar Hill in the adjoining Parish of Madeley, effectively joining together the two separate twin bored tunnels currently planned (one in each of the two Parishes), requiring the line to be sunk deeper, ie “The Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel”. Both parishes have been pressing for this solution to be adopted ever since the HS2a scheme was initially tabled. [ES vol 2 CA4 dated July 2017 proposed scheme = tunnels for a total length of 2.2 Km v page 55: option D9-11.3 = tunnel approximately 6.4Km in length. ie an increase of approximately 4.2Km].

The scale of the devastation that our two Parishes are currently facing is such that:-
- both our local Borough Council of Newcastle under Lyme and our County Council of Staffordshire are supporting us by pettioning in support of this SINGLE TUNNEL solution.
- our MP Sir Bill Cash has very actively supported us by arguing for this SINGLE TUNNEL solution in The House, resulting in the Secretary of State Chris Grayling instructing HS2 to carry out a full evaluation of this solution, at that time HS2 was estimating that the on cost for the single tunnel solution would be around £100m

Now, HS2 confirms in the “HS2 Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel Report - 15th March 2018” that the SINGLE TUNNEL is a practical solution that would very greatly simplify the construction of the line through this area but would incur a significant on-cost. The overall conclusion retained by the two Parishes, after reading this report, and the clear indications given by Richard Johnston at our several meetings with him, is that HS2 recognise that the single tunnel would be the obvious solution to retain provided that the on-cost could be justified and subject to final evaluation of some residual detail effects. Our common objective today is to persuade you that the HARM that the current project would do to our two parishes is so extreme that the on-cost of the single tunnel solution is indeed fully justified.
WHITMORE PARISH:
Whitmore Parish Council believes that the severe devastation that the current HS2 design will wreak upon the beautiful rural environment of our Parish of Whitmore, and the mayhem that it will create on our road network during the construction phase, represent a **VERY HIGH LEVEL OF HARM** both to the Environment of the Parish and to the health and well-being of our Parishioners, which fully justifies completing the full evaluation **AND ADOPTION** of The Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel, despite the extra cost involved. The Environmental and Human costs of the current project design must weigh heavily in the final COST v HARM appraisal. Especially so since the “Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel” solution will also greatly reduce the devastation that the Parish of Madeley faces from the current project design, such that it is also seen as the optimum solution by Madeley Parish Council.

1. The primary concerns of Whitmore Parish Council relate to the devastating impact that the current project will have upon the beautiful rural environment of our Parish, the traffic chaos and structural disruption of our local highways network, and the blight suffered by the owners of properties near to the many different development sites. The current HS2a project design will wreak severe devastation upon the Parish of Whitmore:-
2. **MEDIUM TERM:** During the 7 year construction phase, due to the amount of heavy construction traffic generated, which will swamp our local road network. Tellingly, at one of our early meetings with HS2, Richard Johnston (Senior HS2 Area Manager), our main contact until recently, said at the time to be responsible for the route, commented that one of his main challenges would be to cope with this development in an area whose road network was never designed to cope with the traffic issues that will be involved. The Environmental Statement Volume 2 Community Area Report CA4 Whitmore Heath to Madeley, reviews the main impacts on pages 247 to 250. Of most particular concern are sections 14.4.20 and 14.4.22 which recognise “major adverse effects” at the A51/A53 junction and along the A53 which runs through the middle of the main village in our Parish, Baldwins Gate, and a “moderate adverse effect” on two local link roads (Manor road and Snape Hall road). A further serious local pinch point is the A5182 /A519 which will also be very badly affected and disruptive to commuters to the M6 and the Potteries. This lies on the Construction Traffic route to the South East of Baldwins Gate and will seriously affect traffic flow to and from the A53 above.
A traffic survey was conducted by Travis Baker Transport Planning Ltd, for Bellway Homes, on the A53 through Baldwins Gate village, in March 2017, in connection with Planning Application 16/01101/ful. The full survey results are in the Travis Baker Transport Assessment dated 31/03/2017, starting at page 87 http://publicdocs.newcastle-staffs.gov.uk/AnitePublicDocs/00235107.pdf

The average 5 day two way traffic flow was 13,715 vehicles per day, of which some 900 HGVs (500 Class 1 + 400 Class 2). HS2 confirm that up to an extra 500 heavy Construction Vehicle movements will take place per day throughout the 7 year construction period (e mail from Jeremy Croxall dated 22d February 2018).

Extract: quote “We indicated that the traffic through Baldwin’s Gate in the peak month was in fact in the region of 500 HGV movements per day two-way with a further (approximately) 50 cars or LGVs in each direction. The actual figures are 508 HGV movements per day two-way and 110 cars or LGV movements per day two-way in the peak month. This information is contained within the Transport Assessment report which accompanied the HS2 Phase 2A Environmental Statement. See High Speed Rail (West Midlands - Crewe) Environmental Statement, Volume 5: Technical appendices, Traffic and transport, Transport Assessment (TR-001-000) Part 2, Table 338, Pages 501-502, top row Page 502 which references traffic on the A53 Newcastle Road (between Madeley Road and Holly Bush Lane)” unquote.
3. **PERMANENTLY:** due to the extraordinarily great number of infrastructure implants that are planned, the sheer physical size of some of these, and their adverse impact on the rural environment of our Parish, on local roads, on local properties, on farm businesses, and on PROWs: These will very seriously degrade the beautiful open rural landscape that our Parish enjoys.

We believe that the number, density and scale of these architectural implants is a total over intensification of this section of the route, **the relatively short length of line running through our Parish (# 4 Kms) must rank as near the very worst impacted section of the entire network.** Our residents are stunned by the upset and devastation heading their way and the Parish Council is seriously concerned about the effect that it will have on them when they are forced to cope with the reality of what is currently planned for our Parish. I would like to look at each of these harm effects in sequence.
Pre HS2 Tranquility

A Townscape Character Appraisal report prepared by AECOM for our emerging Neighbourhood Plan (Chapel & Hill Chorlton, Maer & Aston and Whitmore Parishes NDP 2017) bears witness to the attractiveness of this landscape:

“5.2.1 Cumulative description of broader area
The natural landscape provides a shared mutual identity for settlements across the Neighbourhood Area, and is considered to be one of the Neighbourhood Area’s most significant features. The undulating landform, and the numerous controlled views which this topography offers, are valuable assets to the Parishes, and are crucial in defining the character of the Neighbourhood Area. and “there is a high scenic quality across the landscape. and “Roads and lanes are generally narrow and sunken, and have a low visual presence due to being effectively screened by roadside vegetation.” and “Development is generally well screened from the long views across the Neighbourhood Area. Where the views are interrupted, this is usually in the form of singular units”

“Despite the presence of the WCML and the A51/A53, the overall impression across the neighbourhood area is one of tranquillity.

4. The proposed Stableford embankment (565m long x 11m high) and Viaduct (240m long x 12m high) and the Meece embankment (260m long x 10m high) across the beautiful “Meece Valley” **is the first of six major infrastructure HARM impacts. Note that this valley is in Green Belt and is already traversed by the WCML, but at least that line is at ground level. The HS2 line is planned to run along the valley, not far away from the WCML, but 12m up in the air and carrying far faster trains. The visual (and it is feared, the noise) impacts will be far greater than those of the WCML and the combination of the two lines will greatly increase the overall harm to the immediate area, including the neighbouring village of Chorlton ==> **CUMULATIVE IMPACT ISSUE.**

**COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would reduce the HARM by lowering the Viaduct and embankments (by how much remains to be determined).
5. The “Whitmore South” cutting 530m long x 13m deep x 99m wide before entering twin porous portals with permanent building and rescue area accessed onto the busy A53. **Further serious “HARM” in the Green Belt**

6/7 Raising the A53 (the main commuter route between the West + South Wales and Newcastle under Lyme + Stoke on Trent) on an over-bridge 100m long x 4m high, the A53 then being realigned up to a height of 7m above its current level, with earth embankments sloping down on each side, before returning back down to its current level. **This is the second of six major infrastructure HARM impacts. A TRULY MAJOR “BLOT” ON THE LANDSCAPE AND A SERIOUS TRAFFIC DISRUPTION ALONG THIS BUSY “A” ROAD DURING THE CONSTRUCTION PHASE (circa 2 years).**

**COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.
8. A twin bore tunnel 690m long x up to 50m deep, running under Whitmore Heath with all its associated structures (portals etc). Whitmore Heath is a hill, the remains of an old sand and gravel quarry. **This is the third of six major infrastructure HARM impacts.** Prior to the announcement of HS2a, this was one of the two most sought after individual private housing developments (#50 properties) in our Parish. **NOW TOTALLY DEVASTATED with many owners trying to sell out to HS2 or having already done so and left.**

**COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL being so much deeper will reduce or avoid ground borne and airborne noise and so perhaps make this development of #£50 million worth of property, once again a desirable place to live when the scheme has been completed, and make it easier for the Government to advantageously resell the properties that they have bought out currently.
This current tunnel proposal exits by porous portals, again with permanent building and rescue area, leading out into “Whitmore North” cutting 600m long x 13m deep x 45m wide which cuts through the “ANCIENT WHITMORE WOOD” destroying A VERY SIGNIFICANT 6.4ha (one third) OF THIS ANCIENT WOODLAND WHICH WILL BE LOST FOREVER. This single site impact represents # 60% of the total loss (10.2ha) of Ancient Woodland due to this project. This is the fourth of six major infrastructure HARM impacts

A massive concrete retaining wall 577m long x 20m deep with an additional 1.8m parapet is then to be implanted in order to retain in place what is left of the wood. This is the fifth of six major infrastructure HARM impacts, creating a SECOND MAJOR “BLOT” ON THE LANDSCAPE and a source of deflected noise across and around the valley, heavily impacting the families living there, in particular the # 140/150 in Madeley Park Wood, most of which will also suffer the CUMULATIVE NOISE IMPACT of the HS2 line running along the beautiful adjacent LEA VALLEY, WHICH IS ALREADY TRAVERSED BY THE WCML (a repeat of the situation that arises for the beautiful Meece Valley).

COMMENT: The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate these two HARM impacts entirely.
Whitmore Wood viewed from the West
The red line shows the approximate position of the HS2 line
RIVER LEA VIADUCT

12. This leads on to another massive embankment 845m long x 21m high with a noise barrier of up to 4m, followed by an equally massive Viaduct 785m long x 21m high over the river Lea, with noise barrier of up to 3m high, starting in Whitmore Parish and continuing over the border into the adjoining Madeley Parish where these major infrastructure implantations continue. This is the sixth of six major architecture HARM impacts and a THIRD DEVASTATING “BLOT” ON THE LANDSCAPE. The design height of this edifice was initially 11m, but then evolved to 16m and now has reached a “am awesome 21m”, with a high speed train travelling along it...! Section 5.2 in the Tunnel Report makes particular mention of the challenge posed by its construction: “The construction of the River Lea viaduct where it crosses over the WCML at a high skew, is particularly complex and will require railway possessions. It could also result in some disruption to rail services on the WCML because of the proximity of these works to the WCML”.

ALL OF THIS DEVASTATION IS AVOIDED WITH THE WHITMORE TO MADELEY TUNNEL PROPOSAL
THE SANKEY VIADUCT

Stephenson’s solution was to construct an embankment over the West side of the valley, about 823m long and to cross the brook and canal with a viaduct.

The Viaduct currently stands between 18.3m and 21.3m above Sankey Brook.
OTHER SOURCES OF HARM

13. The current design will also have the following impacts in Whitmore Parish:-

- Manor road realigned to cross the HS2 line on an over-bridge 1,000m long x 13m high.
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.

- Snape Hall road widened to 5.5m and permanently closed off part way down.
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate the need to close Snape Hall Road.

- 4 porous portals + 4 tunnel portal buildings and rescue areas + 2 surface water pumping stations.
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.

- River Lea viaduct pre-casting and launching yard. Such a massive concrete production facility will inevitably trigger concern about health which will need to be addressed….
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.

- Heavy construction vehicle traffic on the southern half of Manor Road contrary to written assurances.
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely. It would also greatly reduce the flow of Construction Vehicle traffic along the haul road along the Lea Valley to the A53, further reducing noise impact on the Madeley Park Wood development.

- Major impact on the viability of three local farms:
  g1: The Mainwaring Estate
   **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would not change this HARM impact?
  g2: Snape Hall Farm
   **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.
  g3: Madeley Park Farm
   **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely.

- Cumulative noise impact when the HS2 line is in proximity to the existing West Coast Mainline.
  **COMMENT:** The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate this HARM impact entirely throughout the section between the two short tunnels currently planned.
14. Serious blight to the owners of properties near to the many work sites during the 7 year construction period (noise, dust, loss of value…).

COMMENT: The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate the vast majority of these HARM impacts.

15. Severe difficulties for our parishioners to access the various services that they commonly rely on (schools, doctors, shops, work places and emergency services) due to the disruption of our local road network throughout the 7 year construction period. This is a particular worry due to the high proportion of elderly people in our Parish.

COMMENT: The SINGLE TUNNEL would eliminate most of this HARM impact.
The Madeley Centre
Madeley Academy
Doctors Surgery
Dentist
John Offley Primary School

Doctors Surgery
Whitmore Primary School

Whitmore Village Hall

Whitmore Parish Boundary

Roads Impacted by HS2
- Construction Routes
- Roads Compromised

HOC/00090/0022
FINAL COMMENTS

FIRSTLY - BORE HOLES AND GROUND SURVEYS

The ground under Whitmore Heath was initially believed by HS2 to be “hard conglomerate rock” but has since been recognised to actually be, for some depth, loose sand and gravel (erstwhile sand and gravel quarry). In 2016, HS2 agreed that it would be necessary to carry out a series of bore holes across Whitmore Heath in order to verify the nature of the ground which would have to be tunnelled through and later that there will be a total of 18 such boreholes and that they will be run sufficiently deep to cover both the currently proposed short tunnel and the deeper Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel. Work finally began on these on March 19th this year with the report of the results expected in Autumn 2018. WPC therefor requests that, if the Select Committee is not able at this stage to grant us an “additional provision” for the Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel, the project should be kept under review until the results of the bore hole work is published and any implications for the tunnel constructions have been fully defined (possible impact on the practicality and cost of the two tunnels).
FINAL COMMENTS

OPPORTUNITIES

Secondly, we note with interest sections 5.6.6-5.6.8 of the “Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel” report March 2018 titled “Opportunities” which list eight (8) potential design changes which are currently being considered. Inevitably, we are disappointed that it has not yet been possible to provide any indication of either the likelihood or possible timing of their being recommended for adoption. In the unthinkable event that the SINGLE TUNNEL solution is rejected, Whitmore Parish Council would look forward to the outcome of these studies but wish to reserve the right to a further consultation process on the resulting modifications.

- reduce Meece visual impact
- avoid the need to raise the A53
- replace cut and cover section of Whitmore Heath tunnel with twin bore
- lower the track below Whitmore Heath to reduce noise impact
- reduce height of retaining wall and Whitmore Wood damage **BUT** we fear that this involves worsening the impact on Madeley Wood?
- replace Whitmore Wood over bridge with under bridge (visual impact)
- add PROW to maintain connectivity lost by closure of Snape Hall Road
- further reduce impact on Whitmore Wood
SPOIL MANAGEMENT

Thirdly, in the event that the Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel is adopted, we ask that HS2 be directed to evaluate the viability of removing spoil from the Southern end of The SINGLE TUNNEL directly along the line of route to the A51, thereby avoiding the impact on the A53 through Baldwins Gate and through the A51/A53 junction, of the related construction vehicle traffic.
FINAL COMMENTS

SITE VISIT

Fourthly, we request a Site Visit by the Select Committee to see in situ the nature of the landscape of these two Parishes that will be so completely devastated by the current project, and the very limited capacity of our road network to cope with the requirements of the construction period.
“Finally, we ask the Committee to remember the past history of this area which has suffered so badly due to the demise of the Coal, Steel and Pottery Industries which were its reasons for being.

It would be just too much if the current HS2 Project were to be retained, devastating two of the most attractive parishes on the outskirts of the sprawling urban area of 'The Six Towns', which relies on farming, tourism and as a desirable place to live to attract inward investment to Newcastle and the Potteries. The area was well loved by Charles Darwin who married his wife in nearby Maer Church and walked and theorised in Maer Hills which is situated on the opposite side of the valley to Whitmore Heath off Manor Road.

Please save them for us by recommending the Whitmore to Madeley Tunnel, to protect the valuable amenity that they provide for local people, people from the Potteries and further afield and for future generations that will enjoy this beautiful countryside.”