



House of Commons  
Scottish Affairs Committee

---

# **Minutes of Proceedings**

---

**Session 2006–07**

## The Scottish Affairs Committee

The Scottish Affairs Committee is appointed by the House of Commons to examine the expenditure, administration, and policy of the Scotland Office (including (i) relations with the Scottish Parliament and (ii) administration and expenditure of the office of the Advocate General for Scotland but excluding individual cases and advice given within government by the Advocate General).

### Membership during 2006–07

Mr Mohammad Sarwar MP, (*Lab, Glasgow Central*) (Chairman)  
Danny Alexander MP, (*Lib Dem, Inverness, Nairn, Badenoch and Strathspey*)  
Ms Katy Clark MP, (*Lab, North Ayrshire & Arran*)  
Mr Ian Davidson MP, (*Lab, Glasgow South West*)  
Mr Jim Devine MP, (*Lab, Livingston*)  
Mr John MacDougall MP, (*Lab, Glenrothes*)  
Mr Jim McGovern MP, (*Lab, Dundee West*)  
Mr Angus MacNeil MP, (*SNP, Na h-Eileanan an Iar*)  
David Mundell MP, (*Con, Dumfriesshire, Clydesdale and Tweeddale*)  
Mr Charles Walker MP, (*Con, Broxbourne*)  
Mr Ben Wallace MP, (*Con, Lancaster and Wyre*)

### Powers

The committee is one of the departmental select committees, the powers of which are set out in House of Commons Standing Orders, principally in SO No. 152. These are available on the Internet via [www.parliament.uk](http://www.parliament.uk).

### Publications

The Reports and evidence of the Committee are published by The Stationery Office by Order of the House. All publications of the Committee (including press notices) are on the Internet at [www.parliament.uk/parliamentary\\_committees/scottish\\_affairs\\_committee.cfm](http://www.parliament.uk/parliamentary_committees/scottish_affairs_committee.cfm).

### Committee staff

The staff of the Committee during Session 2006–07 were Mike Clark (Clerk), Gordon Clarke (Clerk), Dr Sue Griffiths (Clerk), Sarah Hartwell-Naguib (Second Clerk), Ian Blair (Senior Committee Assistant), Diane Nelson (Senior Committee Assistant) and Camilla Brace (Committee Assistant).

### Contacts

All correspondence should be addressed to the Clerk of the Scottish Affairs Committee, House of Commons, 7 Millbank, London SW1P 3JA. The telephone number for general enquiries is 020 7219 6123; the Committee's email address is [scotaffcom@parliament.uk](mailto:scotaffcom@parliament.uk).

# Proceedings of the Committee

---

**Tuesday 21 November 2006**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander  
Ms Katy Clark  
Mr Ian Davidson  
Mr Jim McGovern

David Mundell  
Mr Charles Walker  
Mr Ben Wallace

**1. *Effects of tax increases on the oil industry***

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. *Poverty in Scotland***

*Resolved*, That the Committee take oral evidence in Dundee from the Dundee Anti Poverty Forum and Dundee Families Project.

**3. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee visit Glasgow, the Borders and Dundee in connection with the inquiry into poverty in Scotland.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 5 December at 4.00pm]

**Tuesday 5 December 2006**

Members present:

Mr Ian Davidson, in the Chair

Mr Jim McGovern  
David Mundell

Mr Charles Walker  
Mr Ben Wallace

**1. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 December at 9.45am]

*Monday 11– Tuesday 12 December 2006*

*The Chairman, Danny Alexander, Mr Ian Davidson, Mr Jim McGovern, David Mundell and Mr Charles Walker visited Inverness, in connection with the inquiry into Poverty in Scotland, in accordance with the decision of the Committee of 10 October 2006.*

**Tuesday 12 December 2006**

*The Committee met in Committee Rooms 1 and 2, The Highland Council, Inverness*

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander  
Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Jim McGovern  
Mr Charles Walker

**1. *Poverty in Scotland***

Mr Cameron Stark, Honorary Clinical Senior Lecturer, Centre for Rural Health, Mr Fraser Parr, Chairperson, Inverness Trades Council and Mr Sandy Brady, Director of Strategy, Highlands and Islands Enterprise; and

Ms Carron McDiarmid, Head of Policy and Performance, Highland Council, Ms Philomena de Lima, Development Officer, UHI Policy Web, and Ms Carol Greer, Citizens Advice Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 16 January at 4.00pm.]

**Tuesday 16 January 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander  
Ms Katy Clark  
Mr Ian Davidson  
Mr Angus MacNeil

Mr Jim McGovern  
David Mundell  
Mr Charles Walker

**1. *Poverty in Scotland***

Professor Adrian Sinfield, University of Edinburgh, and Professor John Veit-Wilson, Newcastle University, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 6 February at 4.00pm.

## **Tuesday 6 February 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander

David Mundell

Ms Katy Clark

Mr Charles Walker

Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Ben Wallace

Mr Jim McGovern

### **1. *Work of the Committee in 2006***

Draft Report (*Work of the Committee in 2006*), proposed by the Chairman, brought up and read.

*(The Minutes of Proceedings relating to the consideration of the Report are published in the First Report from the Committee, HC308 (2006–07) p.11)*

### **2. *Responsibilities of the Scottish Executive***

*Resolved*, That the Chairman write to the Secretary of State for Scotland.

### **3. *Poverty in Scotland***

Mr Peter Kelly, Director, The Poverty Alliance and Ms Carol Young, Research Officer, Scottish Low Pay Unit, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 20 February at 10.00am.

*Monday 19 – Tuesday 20 February 2007*

*Mr Mohammad Sarwar, Danny Alexander, Katy Clark, Mr Ian Davidson, Mr Jim McGovern, Mr Angus MacNeil, David Mundell and Mr Charles Walker visited Dundee, in connection with the inquiry into Poverty in Scotland, in accordance with the decision of the Committee of 21 November 2006.*

## **Tuesday 20 February 2007**

*The Committee met in the City Chamber, Dundee City Council*

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Angus MacNeil

Mr Ian Davidson

David Mundell

Mr Jim McGovern

Mr Charles Walker

**1. *Poverty in Scotland***

Mr Brian Gordon, Mr Jim Milne, Ms Myra Mackenzie and Rev Erik Cramb of Dundee Anti Poverty Forum; and

Andrew Girvan, Joe Connolly, Frances Tran and John Wallace of NCH Scotland, and Ian Dobson of Dundee City Council, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 6 March at 4.00pm.]

**Tuesday 6 March 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Mr Charles Walker

Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Ben Wallace

Mr Jim McGovern

**1. *Devolution: a decade on***

*Ordered*, That the Chairman speak to the Chairmen of the Welsh Affairs Committee and of the Northern Ireland Affairs Committee in connection with the Constitutional Affairs Committee's inquiry into devolution.

**2. *The sale of BP Grangemouth***

*Resolved*, That evidence should be taken from workforce representatives at BP Grangemouth.

**3. *Hilton Hotel***

*Resolved*, That the Chairman write to the Foreign Secretary and the Secretary of State for Trade and Industry requesting that representations be made to the US Government about the impact that the US embargo of Cuba has on the ability of the Hilton Hotels

Corporation to host Cuban guests in their hotels and that a copy of the letter should be sent to Hilton UK.

**4. *Poverty in Scotland***

Sue Middleton, Research Director, Centre for Research in Social Policy, Loughborough University and Adviser to the Poverty and Disadvantage Committee, Joseph Rowntree Foundation and Guy Palmer, Director, New Policy Institute, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 13 March at 4.00pm.]

**Tuesday 13 March 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander  
Ms Katy Clark  
Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Jim McGovern  
Mr Charles Walker

**1. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee take evidence from the Secretary of State for Scotland on the Scotland Office's Departmental Annual Report on 10 July 2007.

**2. *Poverty in Scotland***

Jason Strelitz, UK Poverty Adviser, Save the Children UK, Douglas Hamilton, Director, Head of Policy & Research, Save the Children UK – Scotland and Claire Telfer, Policy & Parliamentary Officer, Save the Children in Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 20 March at 4.00pm.]

**Tuesday 20 March 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark  
Mr Jim McGovern  
Mr Angus MacNeil

David Mundell  
Mr Charles Walker

**1. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. *Poverty in Scotland***

John Dickie, Head, CPAG (Child Poverty Action Group) Scotland and Dr Paul Dornan, Head of CPAG, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 15 May at 3.45pm.]

**Tuesday 15 May 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Danny Alexander  
Mr Ian Davidson

David Mundell

**1. *Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Chairman write to the Chairman of the Electoral Commission to ask for the terms of reference for its inquiry into the Scottish elections.

**2. *Poverty in Scotland***

Eddie Follan, Public Affairs Manager, Adam Scorer, Director of Campaigns, Energywatch and Elizabeth Gore, Deputy Director, Energy Action Scotland; and

Alistair Buchanan, Chief Executive, Sarah Harrison, Managing Director, Corporate Affairs, and Charles Gallacher, Director of Corporate Communications and Scotland, Ofgem, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 12 June at 4.00pm.]

**Tuesday 12 June 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Angus MacNeil

Mr Jim McGovern

Mr Charles Walker

**1. *Committee visit to Glasgow***

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. *Poverty in Scotland***

Rev Graham K Blount, Scottish Churches Social Inclusion Network and Eileen Baxendale, Chairperson, Baptist Union of Scotland Public Issues Advisory Group, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 19 June at 10.00am.

*Monday 18 – Tuesday 19 June*

*The Chairman, Katy Clark, Mr Ian Davidson, Mr Jim McGovern, Mr Angus MacNeil and David Mundell visited Glasgow, in connection with the inquiry into Poverty in Scotland, in accordance with the decision of the Committee of 21 November 2006.*

**Tuesday 19 June 2007**

***The Committee met in the Pearce Institute, Govan***

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Mr Angus MacNeil

Mr Ian Davidson

**1. *Poverty in Scotland***

Mr Mike Dailly, Principal Solicitor, Govan Law Centre, Susan McPhee, Head of Social Policy and Public Affairs, CAB Scotland, Loretta Gaffney, Manager, Easterhouse CAB, Mr John Patton, National Development Officer, Scottish League of Credit Unions and Mr Chris Mallen, General Manager, Glasgow, ABCUL Scotland, gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 10 July at 4.00pm.

**Tuesday 10 July 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Charles Walker

Mr Angus MacNeil

Mr Ben Wallace

David Mundell

**1. Departmental Annual Report**

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007: Explanatory Memorandum by the Scotland Office**

The Committee considered this matter.

The Explanatory Memorandum by the Scotland Office on the Spring Supplementary Estimate 2007 was ordered to be reported to the House for printing.

**3. Poverty in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to poverty in Scotland be reported to the House for printing:

Finance Committee, Scottish Parliament  
West of Scotland Seniors Forum  
National Carer organisations in Scotland:  
Carers Scotland  
The Prince's Trust – Scotland  
Barnardo's  
CHILDREN 1st  
Capability Scotland  
Equal Opportunities Commission  
Oxfam  
Scottish Executive  
Scottish Refugee Council  
Scotland's Commissioner for Children & Young People  
One Plus  
Scotland Office  
EURespond UK  
Equalities Co-ordinating Group  
Scottish and Southern Energy  
Energy Retail Association

Scottish Power  
Scottish Gas  
Scottish Illegal Money Lending Unit

**4. *Effects of tax increases on the oil and gas industry***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to the effects of tax increases on the oil and gas industry be reported to the House for publishing on the internet:

Professor Alexander Kemp, University of Aberdeen Business School  
Maersk Oil North Sea UK Limited  
Amicus  
Shell UK Limited  
Oil & Gas Independents' Association  
Scottish Enterprise

**5. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 17 July at 3.45pm.]

**Tuesday 17 July 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Katy Clark	Mr Angus MacNeil
Mr Ian Davidson	Mr Charles Walker
Mr Jim McGovern	Mr Ben Wallace

**1. *Departmental Annual Report (i)***

The Committee considered this matter.

**2. *The petrochemical business in Grangemouth: further evidence***

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to evidence taken previously on the implications of the sale of BP's petrochemical business in Grangemouth be reported to the House for publishing on the internet:

T&G (Ineos)  
Ineos

**3. Departmental Annual Report (ii)**

The Rt Hon Des Browne MP, Secretary of State for Scotland, Mr David Cairns MP, Minister of State at the Scotland Office and Dr Jim Wildgoose, Head of the Scotland Office gave oral evidence.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 16 October at 4.00pm]

**Tuesday 16 October 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Mr Ian Davidson

Mr Angus MacNeil

Mr Jim McGovern

**1. Memoranda received since the last meeting**

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to poverty in Scotland be reported to the House for printing:

Nicola Sturgeon MSP, Deputy First Minister & Cabinet Secretary for Health and Wellbeing, Scottish Executive

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to evidence taken previously on the implications of the sale of BP's petrochemical business in Grangemouth be reported to the House for publishing on the internet:

Tom Crotty, CEO Olefins, Ineos

*Ordered*, That the following Memoranda relating to the effects of tax increases on the oil and gas industry be reported to the House for publishing on the internet:

Malcolm Webb, Chief Executive, Oil & Gas UK

Angela Eagle MP, HM Treasury

**2. Poverty in Scotland**

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee visit Edinburgh in connection with the inquiry into Poverty.

*Resolved*, That the Committee take evidence in Edinburgh from the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities and the Scottish Executive on 19 November 2007.

*Resolved*, That the Committee take evidence in Westminster from the Department for Work and Pensions, the Treasury and the Scotland Office on 27 November 2007.

**3. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Resolved*, That the Committee take evidence on the Scottish elections from the Electoral Commission and the Minister of State at the Scotland Office on 13 November 2007.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 23 October at 4.30pm]

**Tuesday 23 October 2007**

Members present:

Mr Mohammad Sarwar, in the Chair

Ms Katy Clark

Ben Wallace

Mr Jim McGovern

**1. *The Committee's programme of work***

The Committee considered this matter.

*Ordered*, That the Chairman write to the Head of the Scotland Office and the unions to establish the whether the matter of a Scottish Civil Service might be a suitable subject for an inquiry.

[Adjourned till Tuesday 13 November at 10.45am]